



**BEFORE THE DISCIPLINARY COMMITTEE OF PAKISTAN MEDICAL & DENTAL
COUNCIL**

In the matter of
Complaint No. PF.8-2196/2022-DC/PMC
Ms. Fatima Haider against Dr. Ghazala Mahmud (5529-P)

Prof. Dr. Muhammad Zubair Khan	Chairman
Barrister Ch. Sultan Mansoor	Secretary
Prof. Dr. Mahmud Aurangzeb	Member (online)
Mr. Jawad Amin Khan	Member (online)
Expert of Gynecology	

Present:

Dr. Ghazala Mahmud (5529-P)	Respondent
Hearing dated	12.12.2024

I. FACTUAL BACKGROUND

1. The instant complaint was lodged by Ms. Fatima Haider (the “Complainant”) being the patient against Dr. Ghazala Mahmud (the “Respondent”), working at Islamabad Institute of Reproductive Medicine, Islamabad (the “Hospital”). The Complainant alleged negligence and mistreatment on the part of Respondent while treating her for fibroids and cysts. Brief facts per complaint, are as under:

The Complainant availed medical services of the Respondent for treatment/removal of fibroids and cysts and was advised to undertake a surgery (Myomectomy).

Complainant being hefty charges for her surgical procedure which was conducted 10.06.2022 for removal of fibroids and cysts. Complainant alleges that during the surgical procedure, the Respondent negligently left surgical gauze inside the body, which was discovered upon facing severe pains, eating and digestion issues.



Complainant states that due to the negligence of the Respondent, she had to undergo several surgical procedures, notwithstanding the acceptance of mistake by the Respondent. Respondent also tried to mitigate effect of her negligence by offering financial respite.

II. SHOW CAUSE NOTICE ISSUED TO RESPONDENT

2. In view of the allegations leveled in the complaint; a Show Cause Notice dated 21.11.2022 was issued to the Respondent, in the following terms:

“...3. WHEREAS, a Complaint has been filed by Ms. Fatima Haider (the "Complainant") before the Disciplinary Committee of the Commission (the "Complaint") which is enclosed along with its annexures and shall be read as an integral part of this notice; and

4. WHEREAS, in terms of the complaint, it has been stated that you were consulted by the Complainant for removal of fibroids and cysts and you advised surgical procedure (Myomectomy). The Complainant has alleged that you negligently performed the surgical procedure and left a surgical gauze piece in the abdomen of the Complainant. Due to your acknowledged negligence, the Complainant suffered miserably and had to undergo number of further corrective procedures; and ...”

III. REPLY OF RESPONDENT

3. The Respondent submitted her response on 20.12.2022, wherein she stated, in terms that:

“...3. Fatima Hassan wife of Syed Hassan Abbas Jaferi, aged about 40 years has approached me at Islamabad Institute of Reproductive Medicines (IIRM) with history of multiple fibroid uterus and heavy menstrual bleeding. She was given conservative treatment in the past by various doctors, but did not improve. Also she gave history of severe Period Pain. On CT Scan with contrast dated 23-05-2022, reflected abdomen large right Adnexul Dermoid Cyst and multiple Uterine Fibroids

4. On presentation dated 04-06-2022, she gave her history as:

- i. 2nd marriage, both husband has 2 kids from first marriage.*
- ii. She lives in Gullberg Green, Islamabad, while her husband lives in Karachi.*
- iii. She was advised Hysterectomy for multiple fibroids by other Gynecologist.*
- iv. Wanted to conceive and safe her uterus.*
- v. We reassured her, will try our best.*



vi. She was referred to us by a friend (our old patient).

5. She disclosed that her husband is not supporting her morally and financially. She cannot afford the direct and allied charges of surgical procedure whereupon she was offered discount of Rs. 50,000/-, which she said will return upon arrangement. We asked her to deposit Rs.150,000 and the balance will be cleared at the final discharge. We did it on her request and the request of her disabled father (on wheelchair).

6. After taking informed written High Risk Consent from the patient, I operated the 1 complainant on 10-06-2022 in IIRM OT, and Anesthesia by Col. (R) Dr. Qaiser. The Surgery (Multiple Myomectomies) performed and multiple fibroid ranging from 2cm upto 10cm were removed. It took almost 2 hrs+ for the total procedure only. Uterus was enlarged upto 20 weeks of pregnancy.

7. There were adhesions in the abdomen and Pelvis, therefore, the Adnexal Cyst was not removed. The fibroids were sent to IDC for Histo-pethology. Reference Operative Details:

Uterus enlarged with multiple fibroids in anterior, posterior, lateral walls. All fibroids removed and dead space obliterated. Haemostasis secured. Uterus stitched with monocryl-1. Peritoneal cavity washed with two liters of warm normal saline. Abdomen closed in layers.

8. The ovarian cyst could not be removed due to multiple dense pelvic adhesions, with gut and omentum. The specimen (multiple fibroids 2cm-10cm) sent for Histo- pathology.

9. The patient remained well during post opp period and was discharged on 13-06-2022 around 6:00pm, with no further charge and adjustment of her due balance was given by my fee.

X 10. After 4 days on 17-06-2022, she came to IIRM again in emergency around 5:00am, 7th post Opp Day), with complaints of severe vomiting, pain abdomen and heavy vaginal bleeding. Emergency treatment was given to stop her pain and vaginal bleeding. She was discharged on 18-06-2022 (with a partially unpaid bill) with advice for OPD follow up on 29-06-2022. As the patient had continuous complaints against digestion during multiple OPD check-ups, therefore I advised her to follow up with Gastroenterologist as well.

11. She again came in IIRM OPD on 22-07-2022 with swelling on right side on abdomen and puss draining from the wound. She was given required medicines and antiseptic wound dressing was done. Also she was advised to come on subsequent days for wound dressing and check-ups (with a partially unpaid bill). ...

13. Immediately general surgeon Dr. Asif (Holy Family Hospital Rawalpindi), was consulted in emergency.



14. She has disclosed her uncordial matrimonial ties and instead of requiring her husband to accompany her at hospital, she has provided the cell number of her brother Jawad, sister Rabab, father and mother. She further wrote a note containing instruction not to call his husband if she dies and even ask him not to attend her funeral.

15. Emergency second surgery was planned on 11-08-2022 with a diagnosis SSI (Surgical site infection), by Dr. Asif Niazi, His surgical notes are as follows:

"Patient opened for abdominal collection in pelvis (Puss). Sigmoid colon was badly stuck to the uterus, around which, there were puss pockets. Palvis washed thoroughly and re-section of suspicious looking area done, and primary anastomosis done, covering colostomy was made, and abdomen closed."

16. The colostomy was not functioning optimally, so senior surgeon Brig. Dar (PAF) was consulted and involved. Necessary investigations advised. L Distal Loopogram Ex-Ray Abdomen Gastrograffin follow through.

17. She was referred to Brig. Dar, General Surgeon at PAF Hospital, Islamabad for further management as the surgeon advised surgery. So Fatima was discharged from IIRM on 23.08.2022 (Charges remained unpaid). There was acute intestinal obstructions secondary to adhesions. Mid-line laparotomy done, on 24-08-2022 by Dr. Dar. His surgical notes, as provided by the complainant, are as follows: "There were dense ileal adhesions which were broken. Serosal tears repaired. Right ovarian teratoma found excised and send for hystopathology."

18. The complainant opted for post opp treatment/ care at IIRM and thus she was again admitted on 28-08-2022. She was discharged on 01-09-2022 in stable and improving condition (Charges remained unpaid).

19. She was again admitted to IIRM on 23-09-2022 for post opp treatment/ care as she has informed that her colostomy reversal procedure has been carried out at PAF hospital on 21.09.2022. She was discharged on 28-09 2022 in perfectly table condition. (However the bills remained unpaid).

20. During entire course of above stated treatment no retained foreign object is discovered and thus any case concerning Gossypiboma is unwarranted. The instant complaint is filed by the complainant just to avoid the charges and professional fee which is accumulated to more than 1,000,000/- to date and despite repeated reminders, the complainant has not paid the same and filed the instant complaint.

IV. REJOINDER OF COMPLAINANT



4. A letter for rejoinder was sent to the Complainant on 23.12.2023 enclosing the comment received from the Respondent doctor, directing her to submit her response. Nonetheless, no rejoinder has been received from the Complainant, till date.

V. IMMEDIATE PAST HEARING

5. Earlier the instant complaint was fixed for hearing before the Disciplinary Committee on 03.05.2024. On the date of hearing, the Complainant was present, however, the Respondent was absent. Hence, the Disciplinary Committee adjourned the matter for a later date.

VI. PRESENT HEARING

6. Presently, the matter was fixed again for hearing before the Disciplinary Committee on 12.12.2024. Notices dated 04.12.2024 were issued to the Complainant and the Respondent, directing them to appear before the Disciplinary Committee on 12.12.2024.
7. At the present hearing, the Respondent was present, however, the Complainant was absent and submitted a written application through counsel, conveying her non-availability in Pakistan and requesting for adjournment of the hearing to a later date.
8. In the interest of justice, the Disciplinary Committee decides to grant one opportunity to the Complainant, Ms. Fatima Haider to appear for personal hearing at the next meeting of the Disciplinary Committee. In case of failure by the Complainant to appear before the next meeting / hearing, the matter shall be decided ex-parte on the basis of available record. Notwithstanding, fresh notices of hearing shall be issued to the Complainant and the Respondent for hearing before the Disciplinary Committee in due course. Adjourned.

Prof. Dr. Muhammad Zubair Khan
Chairman

____ January, 2025